

Final report of the external evaluation “Protection of human rights and basic assistance to sub-Saharan unaccompanied minor and adult migrants in extremely vulnerable situations in Nador, Morocco”

1. Conclusions of the evaluation in relation to the evaluation criteria

Relevance

- The beneficiaries have been supported extensively from the project activities.
- According to the beneficiaries, the project is not only appropriate and relevant, but they need it to continue as it is the only humanitarian initiative in the area, except for the activities of the Nador Diocesan Delegation of Migration.
- The project is adapted to the needs of the beneficiaries and also work as a bridge, through ASTICUDE, to health services, legal institutions and training projects, such as "Second Chance" of the Moroccan Ministry of Education.
- The project has strengthened the beneficiaries' sense of self-esteem and ownership and is very relevant in terms of reinforcing associationism among the most vulnerable migrants.
- The migrants' ability to associate or relate to the rest of Moroccan society has been strengthened through activities such as raising awareness of the health care and prevention system and knowledge of local languages.
- Raising the awareness of Moroccan civil society through the memorandum of defence of migrants' human rights signed by 25 local associations has also been important.

Effectiveness

- The project has been very effective in terms of achieving the specific objective and the four outcomes, and most of the expected values of each indicator were largely achieved with some exception.
- Outcome 4 "The humanitarian situation of sub-Saharan migrants in Nador (with special attention to unaccompanied minors and girls) will have been witnessed in Andalusia" has had the most difficulties in achieving the expected targets due to the restrictions imposed by the pandemic, both in Morocco and in Andalusia.
- The project has contributed to guaranteeing the protection of the fundamental rights to health and an adequate standard of living of sub-Saharan migrant unaccompanied minors and adults in a situation of extreme vulnerability. It is important to note that it has only contributed to guarantee their rights and has not been able to guarantee their rights.
- The project could not be implemented according to plan and appropriate measures were taken, requesting an extension of the deadline and budgetary modifications that ensured the effectiveness of the project. The pandemic situation caused the unexpected external factors that led to the changes in the schedule and budget.

- Staff in charge of the project in ASTICUDE and Fundación APY were able to adapt to the adverse circumstances caused by the pandemic despite the risks.

- The fundamental conditions of access to health care for sub-Saharan unaccompanied migrant, minors and adults have been improved by covering their needs in terms of health care, food and accommodation. In addition, the fear of going to health care centres has been reduced.

- The psychosocial vulnerability of the beneficiaries assisted has also been reduced.

- Civilian local authorities have been encouraged to try to ensure adequate conditions for the protection and humanitarian assistance of sub-Saharan unaccompanied minor migrants and adults in situations of extreme vulnerability, although there is still a long way to go.

Efficiency of the project

- The project budget has been spent according to plan and the supporting documents for the various payments have been verified.

- Despite the risks and difficulties caused by the pandemic, the project was completed on time, following the modifications approved by the AACID.

- The modifications to the budget have enabled efficient spending and proper financing of activities, as well as the use of resources to achieve results and objectives.

- The budget, despite the modifications and the extension of the implementation period, has been used efficiently.

Impact

- The effects of the project have gone beyond what was expected and the impact of the project, in positive terms, has been very high.

- The specific objective has been met and has "contributed to guaranteeing the protection of the fundamental rights to health and an adequate standard of living of sub-Saharan unaccompanied migrant, minors and adults in a situation of extreme vulnerability", although it has not been possible to guarantee it. Fundación APY and ASTICUDE have fulfilled their obligations as responsibility bearers, but it is up to the Moroccan authorities, as duty bearers, to guarantee the right to health.

- ASTICUDE's role is essential in the province of Nador for sub-Saharan migrants and, above all, for those in extremely vulnerable situations.

- The fundamental health conditions of the beneficiaries have improved thanks to the coverage of their needs in health care, food and shelter, which have exceeded the expected scope.

- An important unintended effect has been the reduction of the fear of going to a health centre, which was previously widespread, as well as the feeling that the ASTICUDE project makes the beneficiaries feel better and strengthens their faith in the future.

- Similarly, the psychosocial vulnerability of the project beneficiaries has been reduced beyond expectations and legal assistance has been provided to more migrants than expected.

- Regarding the sensitisation of Moroccan civil authorities and NGOs, the impact of the project has been very positive and their attitude towards the project beneficiaries is improving and is enabling collaboration between ASTICUDE and other organisations.

Connectivity and viability

- The project represents a unique opportunity in the area to promote projects to support vulnerable migrant communities and to link existing development projects with ASTICUDE's humanitarian project.

- Considering the so-called triple nexus approach, ASTICUDE as an association, as well as the work of the Nador Diocesan Delegation for Migration, are essential as a bridge between the most vulnerable unaccompanied migrant, minors and adults and the rest of the development initiatives in the region.

- The project is very important to reinforce the migrants' sense of unity and their associationism. It is also an important link with health services, legal institutions and training projects such as "Second Chance" of the Moroccan Ministry of Education.

Gender and LGTBIQ+ approach

- Migrant women, young and adult, in situations of extreme vulnerability in the region have played a leading role in the project, both in planning and implementation.

- The project has incorporated gender equality elements into the planning, which are clearly visible in the outcome indicators.

- There are areas that still need to be strengthened to increase the role and empowerment of women: decision-making within migrant collectives; possibility of reporting abuses and protection against them as well as the expansion of access to health services.

- Participation of beneficiaries belonging to the LGTBIQ+ community has not been considered in the project. It can be said that they constitute a "non-existent" or "invisible" group.

2. Evaluation recommendations

The following recommendations are organised according to the actor to whom they are addressed and based on the findings and conclusions. Recommendations are presented to three types of actors: to ASTICUDE and APY Foundation as planning and implementing organisations; to AACID as funding agency; as well as to civil society organisations in Nador, as a key partner for the achievement of the objectives and, above all, as a group with the capacity to influence the improvement of the rights of migrants and unaccompanied minors in situations of vulnerability. After the experience of the project and the evaluation process, it has not been considered realistic to include recommendations to the civil authorities directly, nor to the health services and needless to say, neither towards the Moroccan police forces and the Moroccan army. However, civil society organisations in Nador could have an impact on these institutions, albeit with reservations and broad limitations.

Recommendations for ASTICUDE and the APY Foundation:

- In order to contribute to guaranteeing the human rights (the fundamental rights to health and an adequate standard of living) of sub-Saharan unaccompanied migrant, minors and adults in situations of extreme vulnerability, ASTICUDE and the APY Foundation should continue and reinforce their activities to raise awareness among Moroccan civil society in Nador of their situation.
- Although they have made an important effort in the pandemic situation, ASTICUDE and APY Foundation should promote dissemination activities, trying to raise awareness among the Andalusian and Spanish public opinion, developing audio-visual material to be disseminated on social networks and channels such as YouTube.
- ASTICUDE and APY Foundation should continue with their capacity to adapt to the circumstances and scenarios in Nador, monitoring the risks and external factors that may affect their ongoing or future projects.
- ASTICUDE and Fundación APY should improve, in future projects, information regarding access to health services and psychosocial assistance for migrants and unaccompanied minors in vulnerable situations.
- ASTICUDE and Fundación APY should reinforce, in future projects, gynaecological and maternal and infant care for migrant beneficiaries and unaccompanied minors in vulnerable situations.
- ASTICUDE and Fundación APY should improve in future projects the information regarding access to legal and human rights defence services for migrants and unaccompanied minors in vulnerable situations.
- APY Foundation and ASTICUDE should formalise relations with other development projects and initiatives in the area in order to strengthen synergies and connectivity. For example, with the "Second Chance" programme of the Moroccan Ministry of Education or with projects funded by the IOM. This would have an impact on the practical application of the triple nexus approach.
- APY Foundation and ASTICUDE should strengthen access to vocational training for migrants and unaccompanied minors in vulnerable situations.

Recommendations for AACID:

- AACID should continue with its important financial support and increase the possibilities of implementing similar projects in the Nador area, given the important impact they represent and the excellent cost-effectiveness ratio.
- AACID could interact with other Andalusian and national institutions in order to improve the dissemination of projects such as this one, not only by publicising the precarious situation in which the beneficiaries find themselves, but also by showing the possibilities of humanitarian assistance.
- AACID can organise, together with Andalusian universities, discussion and dissemination forums where projects such as ASTICUDE and Fundación APY's can be presented, commented on and discussed.

- For future projects and given the climate of political instability in the area, AACID should provide mechanisms for flexibility in planning elements that may be modified as a result of political crises.
- AACID should continue and expand its support to ASTICUDE and APY Foundation projects in order to improve the fundamental conditions of access to health care for sub-Saharan unaccompanied minors and adult migrants, covering their needs in terms of health care, food and shelter. Because of the importance of ASTICUDE in the area, in many cases this support is vital for the beneficiaries.
- The AACID should increase the possibilities of funding projects for vocational training for migrants and unaccompanied minors in vulnerable situations in the Nador area, with a view to strengthening the educational aspect.
- AACID can be a bridge for the dissemination of information regarding the abuses suffered by migrants and unaccompanied minors in vulnerable situations in Nador.

Recommendations for civil society organisations in Nador:

- With the significant decrease in fear of going to care centres evidenced by the project, civil society organisations in Nador need to continue to raise awareness among the rest of society and strengthen their role as a connector between civil authorities.
- Civil society organisations in Nador should put pressure on the civilian authorities to sensitise the Moroccan state security forces to the human rights of vulnerable migrants. Only in this way can ASTICUDE's and APY Foundation's projects aspire to be based on a rights-based approach and not just a needs-based approach.
- Civil society organisations in Nador, with the support of the APY Foundation and ASTICUDE, should contribute to increase the associationism of migrants and unaccompanied minors in vulnerable situations. Then, the negotiation capacity of the beneficiaries as a group is strengthened.
- Civil society organisations in Nador, with the support of the APY Foundation and ASTICUDE, should continue their relationship with health authorities and hospitals, trying to regularise and formalise the treatment of migrants and unaccompanied minors in vulnerable situations. This can be achieved through the development of databases and medical records, among other measures.
- Civil society organisations in Nador, with the support of the APY Foundation and ASTICUDE, should influence civil, police and military authorities to comply with basic humanitarian principles, as well as the fundamental element of protection in humanitarian action.
- Civil society organisations in Nador, with the support of the APY Foundation and ASTICUDE, should create mechanisms for reporting abuses against migrants and unaccompanied minors in vulnerable situations. These mechanisms should include protection components and protocols for the complainant to ensure their safety and should also include specific components and modalities for women and girls.
- Civil society organisations in Nador, with the support of the APY Foundation and ASTICUDE, should aim to "make visible" the LGTBIQ+ community within the group of migrants and unaccompanied minors in vulnerable situations in Nador.